DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 340 631 SO 021 516

AUTHOR Fleming, Dan B.
TITLE Social Studies Reform and Global Education: California, New York, and the Report of the National Commission on Social Studies.
PUB DATE Jun 90
NOTE 22p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Social Science Education Consortium (Evanston, IL, June 21-23, 1990).
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Citizenship Education; *Curriculum Development; *Curriculum Evaluation; Educational Change; *Educational Objectives; Elementary Secondary Education; Global Approach; *Social Studies
IDENTIFIERS California; *Global Education; National Commission on Social Studies in Schools; New York

ABSTRACT

There has been a movement in social studies education in recent years to provide greater emphasis on global education. This paper evaluates efforts undertaken in this regard by the states of California and New York and by the National Commission on Social Studies in the Schools. California adopted a History-Social Science Framework for their public schools in July, 1987. The study of history is the linchpin of this K-12 curriculum. A significant amount of time is devoted to world history, with courses taught in grades 6, 7, and 10. In two places, grades 10 and 12, the curriculum focuses on problems and issues of the world today in an open-ended approach. The State of New York's revised social studies curriculum was implemented in stages over the course of the 1980s. While not as far-reaching in its emphasis on global education as California's curriculum, New York's program devotes significant time to developing a global perspective. The main global education thrust of the curriculum is found in grades 9 and 10 under the title of "global studies." The New York program seems to have more of a "citizenship" building and contemporary flavor to it than does California. The National Commission on the Social Studies in the Schools Report, "Charting a Course: Social Studies for the 21st Century," was issued in November 1989. The cornerstone of the report is the 3-year (grades 9-11) world and U.S. history and geography sequence. The goal is to integrate national and historical change to allow students to connect the national past with its larger international setting. However, the report fails to give adequate attention to the contemporary world. (DB)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED340631

Social Studies Reform and Global Education: California, New York and the Report of the National Commission on Social Studies

Dan B. Fleming, Professor, Social Studies Education
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
Blacksburg, VA 24061-0313

A Paper Presented at the Annual Meeting of the
Social Science Education Consortium

June, 1990

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

DAN B. FLEMING

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Office Telephone: 703-231-5537
Home Telephone: 703-951-1525

SO 021516

ws534

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Social Studies Reform and Global Education:

California, New York and the Report of the

National Commission on Social Studies

Dan B. Fleming, Professor, Social Studies Education

Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University

Blacksburg, VA

June, 1990

Definitions of Global Education

There seems to be a general consensus in the social studies community that greater emphasis needs to be given to some form of global education. But there still exists differing viewpoints as to what constitutes global education and where it should be taught in the curriculum. A traditional definition of what is "global education" is offered by former Secretary of Education William J. Bennett:

> students should learn geography and foreign languages, some foreign literature, and a lot of European history. They should be familiar with Western civilization's religious traditions, and with the central place of religion in the lives of its peoples. They should be aware of totalitarianism's ghastly contempt for the triumph of religious liberty in the West, and of the unnatural replacement of God by man and state under Communism. Students should learn about the Greeks, and about the Romans; about feudalism, the Magna Carta, the Renaissance, and the Enlightenment; about the French Revolution, the Industrial Revolution, and the Russian Revolution; about World War I and World War II.[1]

A broader version focusing on global interdependence is implied in the 1989 report of the National Governor's Association calling for an education more responsive to a changing world:

> Times have changed. Revolutionary advances in science, technology, communications, and transportation have brought nations and peoples together. World trade and financial, economic, and political developments have transformed disparate economic systems into a highly interdependent global marketplace. Today, the nations that inhabit the planet are often more closely linked than neighboring states or villages were at the turn of the century.
>
> Yet these important changes are not reflected in the way many U.S. schools prepare students for citizenship. In educating students, the languages, cultures, values, traditions, and even the location of other nations are often ignored. Schools and universities reflect the same lack of global understanding that pervades the nations from government and business leaders to school children.[2]

Another view of global education is offered by Willard M. Kniep, Vice President for Research and Development at the American Forum for Global Education.[3] Kniep proposes four essentials of global education for the scope of the social studies curriculum: the study of systems; the study of human values; the study of persistent issues and problems; and the study of global history.[4] These go considerably beyond the Bennett definition by focusing on "persistent problem areas" in four categories: peace and security; national/international development; environmental problems; and human rights.[5]

Social Studies Reform

The reform movement in social studies education to date consists more of reports and the publishing of negative test results than action. However, two states haves taken concrete steps to modify their social studies curriculum. The most dramatic change can be found in the state of California. A more modest effort was undertaken in New York. Finally, the National Commission on Social Studies in the Schools issued their recommendations for reform in November, 1989 in a heralded session at the National Council for the Social Studies. Let us now examine how the two states and the recent National Commission of the Social Studies have treated global education in their social studies K-12 scope and sequence.

The California Framework

California adopted a History-Social Science Framework for their public schools in July, 1987.[6]

The Framework Committee determined that history would be the focal discipline in the K-12 scope and sequence. In the introduction, the Committee cites preparing students for "comprehending global interrelationships" as one of the reasons for the revision.[7] The introduction presents seventeen distinguishing characteristics for this Framework.[8] Characteristic nine states, "the world history sequence stresses the concept of global interdependence. Special attention is to be paid to the study of non-Western societies in recognition of Asian, African and other non-Western peoples."[9] In the Framework's section on "Goals and

Curriculum Strands," there are several points that apply to a global approach. Under "ethical literacy," students must "understand the ways in which different societies have tried to resolve ethical issues."[10] Under "geographic literacy," students must "understand human and environmental interaction" and "understand world regions and their historical, cultural, economic, and political characteristics."[11] Under economic literacy, students must "understand the basic economic problems confronting all societies" and understand "comparative economic systems."[12] Under sociopolitical literacy, students must understand comparative political systems."[13] Clearly the study of other parts of the world beyond the United States is a major part of the California Framework.

The major change in the California curriculum is the significant increase in the time allocated to world history. There are three courses in world history, grades, six, seven, and ten. Grade six emphasizes the ancient world to A.D. 500. Grade seven continues world history from A.D. 500-1789. Grade ten continues from 1789 to the present.

Three years are also given to United States history, grades, five, eight, and eleven. There is an interplay between the world and United States history courses to help students think of the United States in a "global context."

In the primary grades, K-3, there is in grade one a unit of study on "cultural diversity" that mentions the study of "people of other cultures." The unit includes the use of literature from other nations such as African and Japanese folk tales.

In grade two, students touch on global interdependence through a study of food suppliers and where their ancestors originated. They also will study biographies of people who have "made a difference" from many cultures," now and long ago."[14] Grades three and four cover local and state history and grade five, United States history from discovery to 1850.

Grade six begins the three part world history sequence. Ancient civilizations in both the West and East are covered including the ancient Hebrews, Greeks, Romans, Indians and Chinese to 500 A.D.

Grade seven covers medieval and early modern times to 1789. Religions are given considerable attention in both grades seven and eight. In grade seven Islam is introduced as well as the African states and civilizations of Middle and South America. China and Japan receive attention along with parallel developments in Europe.

Students next encounter the world beyond ninth grade electives in grade ten. The course opens with the study of the "Unresolved Problems of the Modern World" such as famine in Africa, war and terrorism, and environmental destruction.[15] Students next turn to a review of the use of democratic ideas. Then they return to world history and the Industrial Revolution in eighteenth century England. A unit is offered on imperialism and colonialism through a case study in India. From this point the curriculum leaps to World War I and its consequences leading to totalitarianism in Nazi Germany and Stalinist Russia. World War II is studied and then nationalism today illustrated by case studies of the Soviet Union and China, Israel and Syria, Ghana and South Africa and

Mexico and Brazil. Missing in action from the historical sequence are the events in Europe and the world from 1789 to World War I with the exceptions of the Industrial Revolution in England and the colonial case study on India.

In grade eleven, students study United States history in the twentieth century including the U.S. role in World War II. A unit is devoted to the Cold War and another unit to postwar relationships with Latin American and Canada. Grade twelve has a semester of Principles of American Democracy and a semester of economics. Under Principles of Democracy there is a unit on comparative governments, with an emphasis on communism today. Included are questions asking why do East Germans risk their lives scaling the Berlin Wall? The semester course concludes with students doing an activity such as a research paper on a major social issue. Issue examples are nuclear arms proliferation and demands for democratic governments in Latin America.

The semester economics course includes the study of comparative economics systems. In a final unit students focus on international economics concepts including balance of trade issues.

California Summary

Overall the California Framework devotes a great deal of time to the study of the world beyond the United States from grades six through twelve. The primary vehicle of study is world history from ancient civilizations to the present, both West and non-West. The role of religions in the world is emphasized as well as political and economic systems, particularly communism and fascism. Case

studies are used, as for example the concept of imperialism and colonialism, presented through the Indian experience. In two places, grades ten and twelve, the curriculum focuses on problems and issues of the world today in an open ended approach. There is an emphasis on human rights issues particularly highlighting the atrocities of Hitler and Stalin and a multicultural theme runs throughout the Framework.

The program has a certain Cold War warrior flavor of outdatedness about it. Recent changes in Eastern Europe and the USSR already outdate it. There seems to be lacking a focus on where the world is today and where it may be heading. Although opportunities exist to study current developments, modern Japan and Germany and the European Community as world players seems slighted in this 1987 program.

Grade twelve seems flat and does not pull the entire K-12 framework together in a "big" picture windup. The last line of the last unit suggests "students review their tenth grade studies of developing nations and consider what factors, conditions, and policies help these notions to achieve sustained economic growth."[16] One gets the impression that the Framework designers ran out of gas before they got to grade twelve. The conceptual theme of global interdependence advocated by Willard Kniep seems lacking in the California Framework even though it works hard at covering separate political and economic systems.

New York's Social Studies Program

New York began a process of curriculum revision in 1980 with the development of a plan to revise the State's secondary (7-12) social studies curriculum. In 1984 the Board of Regents adopted a Action Plan that included new examination requirements in social studies and added a fourth unit of social studies to the high school program. The elementary level program was updated as well. In the late 1980's a revised program was put into place.

At the K-3 level, the program includes a global perspective so students explore how families live throughout the world including clothes, food, holidays and customs. A stated goal is to "decrease egocentric perceptions."[17] In grade one, students "consider topics in the news of global concerns illustrating interdependence and human needs such as hunger in Africa, war in Central America and the Middle East."[18] These levels also give attention to ethnic and cultural diversity while still focusing on developing a sense of local community. Grade three is where students really move into the study of communities around the world including Western and non-Western examples. Students may compare communities in the US with their counter parts elsewhere in a "wet lands - dry lands" approach.

Grades 4-6 continue to build on the primary program with Grade four devoted to the local community compared with the state and national levels. Grade five stresses the United States, Canada, and Latin America with a geographic and economic emphasis, not historical as is usually the case. Grade six emphasizes interdependence keying on Western and Eastern Europe and the

Middle East with an economics and geographic emphasis. Again this is an marked departure from the traditional "kitchen sink" world studies approach used in most states for grade six.

Grades seven and eight are devoted to United States and New York State history including linkages with Canada and New Mexico. Little time is devoted to global education at these two grade levels beyond our two hemispheric neighbors.

The main global education thrust of the curriculum is found in grades nine and ten under the title of "global studies." The two year block is designed to be flexible with units built around non-Western regions such as Africa and South Asia but it also does not neglect the role of Western Europe in shaping our values and institutions. The syllabus recommends that case studies be used to illustrate major ideas or themes such as "the dynamics of change" and the contemporary world is a focal point with African nationalism and the recent events in South Africa used as an example.[19] There is an introductory unit and eight other units included in the two year syllabus. If the unit sequence is followed, grade ten resembles a survey course of Western civilization beginning in the Middle East ending with the world today.

Grade eleven is a survey of US History and grade twelve is a two semester course with one semester on Participation in Government and the other semester on economics and economic decision making. Unit four of the economics semester is the "United States and the World Economy" and cover topics such as international trade, alternative economic systems and economic problems of

developing notions. The final unit examines the economics of population growth and resource scarcity.[20]

New York Summary

The New York program differs from California in that history is not as dominant although it still is a major player in the curriculum. Economics, geography and political science fare better as disciplines in New York. Like California, the New York approach narrows the breadth of content to be covered. For example in grades five and six much less is recommended to be covered than is true for the national pattern. New York in grades nine and ten has two years of global studies but compromises between a regional and historical approach. The New York program seems to have more of a "citizenship" building and contemporary global flavor to it than does California.

The National Commission on Social Studies in the Schools Report

The November, 1989 report, Charting A Course: Social Studies for the 21st Century, is much less detailed than either the California Framework or the New York program. It has five goals, one of which relates specifically to global education. Goal four wants to enable students to develop "an understanding of other people, and the unity and diversity of world history, geography, institutions, traditions, and values."[21] The curriculum structure recommended for grades K-12 is briefly described in thirteen pages. For grades K-3, the report asks that a "balance be maintained across local, national and global information

and concepts."[22] The report for K-3 suggests in several places that students should be aware of the world. The most concrete recommendation in the global area is that "by the end of grade three pupils have achieved an elementary understanding of world geography - continents, major countries, and climate zones, for example."[23]

For grades 4-6, three courses are recommended to be taught: "a) United States history) world history, and c) geography, both physical and cultural."[24] The world history course is briefly described as running from Paleolithic hunting and gathering to the world in modern times. The Report urges teachers to "sample adequately the variety of human experience across the centuries and among the great cultures of the world."[25] The Report calls for "separate attention to geography" with a focus on physical geography and "regional patterns of human land use, agriculture, economic activity and environment."[26] "By the end of grade six, students should know much factual information" from the disciplines and how these facts relate to "national and global understanding."[27]

Grade seven focuses in the local community and grade eight "addresses the economic and political development of the United States and its changing socio-economic-political relationships with the rest of the world."[28] Included in grade eight is the comparative study of capitalism, socialism and communism through the use of case studies. The course description is very vague beyond this point.

The keystone of the Report is the three-year world and American history and geography sequence. The goal is to integrate national and historical change to allow students to "connect the national past with its larger international setting."[29] Course one covers the world from pre-historical time to 1750. World religions are given particular attention. Course two covers 1750-1900 centered on three themes: "the democratic revolution, the industrial and technological revolution and the modern growth and mobility of population and the impact that has had."[30] Course three runs from 1900 to the present and continues the three dominant themes prior to 1900. Again the Report calls for the use of case studies to explore the three themes.

Grade twelve has two semester-length courses and suggests alternate patterns centered on government and economics, taught separately or in combination. For government, political ideologies and institutions at all levels should be treated and students should utilize mass media related to government. The Report offers another alternative, a combined government and economics course that would include the study of multinational organizations such as NATO and the World Bank. Finally, the Report suggests other grade twelve options such as courses in anthropology, sociology and psychology, or a multidisciplinary study of contemporary issues, or a community service project.[31] Apparently for grade twelve, a number of possibilities would satisfy the National Commission.

Summary of the National Commission Report

It is somewhat ironic that a Report issuing recommendation for social studies in the elementary grades 4-6 did not see fit to use a social studies approach, but preferred to have separate courses in geography and world history. United States geography disappeared completely without even a mention as being part of the US history course. Regional and contemporary geography and cultures also were not to be found.

Grade eight had a vague statement about comparative economic systems and was ill-defined as a course. It did plug international events and understandings.

The obvious love of the Commission seems to be grades 9-11 and the three-year World/American history and geography sequence. Grades ten and eleven were centered on three major themes but at the end, the latest event mentioned was the petroleum shock of the 1970's. This leaves the reader wondering if there is any priority given to the world of the past decade and the present.

Grade 12 has several classes recommended that are so different ranging from government/economics to sociology to community service, that one wonders if that is any preferred approach or did the Commission run out of gas by that point. What does not clearly emerge from the Report is that the contemporary world is to be an important part of the curriculum. Perhaps the closest the curriculum comes to the "pervasive and enduring global issues" that the National Council for the Social Studies describes as vital to the curriculum is in grade six

where students give attention to environmental issues such as global warming and acid rain.[32]

Overall Conclusions

The three social studies programs described are somewhat different and each has unique features that should be carefully considered for possible revisions throughout the United States. The California Framework authors have bravely made their move in most tightly defining their curriculum as does New York in their lengthier syllabi. History dominates in California and world history has gained ground compared with national and state. California has provided several points where contemporary global issues are to be given attention. A major flaw of California's program seems to be the apparent loss of Europe from 1789 to the present except for a focus on Stalinism and the Holocaust.

New York devotes the most attention to skills and uses a conceptual approach. It has made less dramatic changes than California and the National Commission recommended structure. However, New York has narrowed courses in scope as in grade five and six and has provided a two-year global studies program for grades nine and ten. New York is less history-dominated and draws more from other disciplines.

The National Commission Report also devotes greater attention to the world through their proposed three year world and United States history and geography sequence. However contemporary global issues seemed to be lacking in priority.

ws534

All three devote more time to the world as part of their curriculum. The California and the National Commission Report are particularly dominated by world history and would seem to match better with the William Bennett definition of global studies while New York seems to lean more to the Kniep version of global interdependence and contemporary world issues. New York is also less dependent on history and is more interdisciplinary in approach, particularly using a geographic and economic emphasis.

Notes

1. William G. Bennett, "America, the World and Our Schools," Teaching International Policies in High School, Ed. Raymond English, Washington, D.C., Ethics and Public Policy Center, 1989, p.8.

2. American in Transition -- The International Frontier: Report of the Task Force on International Education, National Governors' Association, Washington, D.C., 1989.

3. Willard M. Kniep, "Social Studies Within A Global Education," Social Education, October, 1989.

4. Ibid, p. 400

5. Ibid, p. 401

6. History -- Social Science Framework, California State Board of Education, July, 1987.

7. Ibid, p. 3

8. Ibid, p. 3-8

9. Ibid, p. 6

10. Ibid, p. 14

11. Ibid, p. 17

12. Ibid

13. Ibid, p. 19

14. Ibid, p. 40

15. Ibid, p. 84

16. Ibid, p. 111

17. Social Studies Program, Grade 1, The State Education Department Bureau of Curriculum Development, Albany, NY, 1987, p. 39

18. Ibid, p. 62

19. Ibid, p. 9-10

20. Ibid, p. 12

ws534

21. Charting A Course: Social Studies for the 21st Century. National Commission on Social Studies in the Schools. Washington, D.C., 1989, p.6.

22. Ibid, p. 7

23. Ibid, p. 9

24. Ibid, p. 10

25. Ibid

26. Ibid, p. 11

27. Ibid

28. Ibid, p. 13

29. Ibid, p. 14

30. Ibid, p. 25

31. Ibid, p. 19-20

32. Ibid, p. 11

Comparisons

California Framework		New York Social Studies Program		National Commission on Social Studies	
Grade 1	Unit on cultural diversity including people of other cultures.	*Kindergarten*	Includes families throughout the world.	*K-3*	Calls for balance across local, national and global information and concepts. In grade one, examines life of people around the world. In K-3, examines religious holidays around world. By end of grade 3, pupils should have elementary understanding of world geography.
Grade 2	Unit includes people who have made a difference from many cultures. A unit on satisfying needs touches on where food comes from.	*Grade 1*	Includes families, schools, and communities all over the world.	*Grades 4-6*	Includes a course on world history and a course on geography.
Grade 6	Ancient civilizations in the West and East to 500 A.D. Includes China, India, Hebrews, Greeks, and Romans.	*Grade 2*	Continues grade 2 themes.	*Grade 8*	Includes study of different economic systems and US role in the world system.
Grade 7	World history from 500 A.D. to 1789. Adds Islam, African states and civilizations of Middle and Latin America.	*Grade 3*	Expands focus on world community and global news issues.	*Grade 9*	World and US history and geography to 1750.
Grade 10	Unit on Unresolved Problems of Modern World, Industrial Revolution in England in 1800rds, Colonialism case study, India, World War I, World War II with emphasis on atrocities of Stalin and the Holocaust. Ends with nationalism in modern world through four pairs of nations: USSR-China, Israel-Syria, Ghana-South Africa, and Mexico-Brazil.	*Grade 5*	United States, Canada, and Latin America: geographic and economic emphasis.	*Grade 10*	Same, 1750-1900.
		Grade 6	Western Europe, Eastern Europe, Middle East: geographic and economic emphasis.	*Grade 11*	Same, since 1900.
Grade 11	US History in 20th Century -- US in WWII, the Cold War, US-Canadian-Latin American relations.	*Grades 7-8*	US focus with links to Canada and Mexico.	*Grade 12*	Several approaches -- could include study of multinational organizations.
Grade 12	Comparative Government with emphasis on Communism, Contemporary Issues Today Activity, Comparative Economic Systems, International Economic Concepts.	*Grades 9-10*	Global Studies with focus in nine on Africa, South and East Asia and Latin America and in ten, the Middle East, Western Europe, USSR and Eastern Europe.		
		Grade 12	Includes unit on US and World Economy. Also unit on economics of population growth and global resource scarcity.		

By Dan B. Fleming, VPI&SU
Blacksburg, VA 24061-0313

BEST COPY AVAILABLE